

File NO- 24/28- FEA 153

File No. 24(28)-FEA/56

SECRET

19

Collection No.

Record Permanent  
'B'

Govt. of India

Min. of External Affairs

FOR OR NOT FOR NOTE BOOK.

FEA Section

Pros. Serial Nos.

D. 299-EA/57.

### SUBJECT

Netaji Enquiry Committee - Publication of  
Secret material by Sh. S.C. Bose, a member  
of the Committee - Desirability of taking  
action against him - (not to be taken).

#### Previous References

F. 30(26)-FEA/55.

F. 24(25)-FEA/56.

#### Later References



42170

To be retained  
for 5 years.

140/S/RM/95  
15/11

DECLASSIFIED

S. 97 (Unbleached).

MFP-541 General-6862-A-(C-597)-20-8-54-0.000.000

H. K. Katyal  
5-4-57



(गौतम गुप्ता)  
(GAUTAM GUPTA)  
उप सचिव (ए. ए. आर. एम.)  
Dy. Secretary (A&RM)  
विदेश मंत्रालय, नई दिल्ली  
Ministry of External Affairs  
New Delhi

Imreexet  
17/4/82



SRR

947  
S. 431  
57

Issue Register No.

**REQUISITION FOR PAPERS**

Heading

Month—

Nos.

Part—

File No. 22(12)FEA/56

Collection No.

(To be filled in by Duftry.)

To be put up with— 22(16)FEA/56

Initials and date—  
(Year to be given.)

Hani Datta Kalye  
1.3.1956

Signature of Duftry—  
(with date of supply.)

SUBJECT (if necessary).

S.R.R.

Issue Register No.

263

REQUISITION FOR PAPERS.

57

Heading—

Month—

Nos.

Part—

File No.

22(12) FEA/56

Collection No.

(To be filled in by Duftry).

To be put up with—

F. 28(7) FEA/55

Initials and date—

(Year to be given).

Hani with Katerul  
16-1-57 E A section

Signature of Duftry—

(with date of supply).

SUBJECT (if necessary).

S. 43.

MFP-568 S&P-6805-(M-1118)-16-1-46-20,000 Pads.



Ministry of External Affairs.  
(EA Sec.)

Sub: Dissident Report by Shri. Suresh Chandra Bose,  
Member, Netaji Inquiry Committee. (Copy placed)

By. 299-EA/57.

(1)

"Will DS(E) H. have 'A' below checked? SD/- B.A. Acharya, 24/12

(2) - Issue.

Ref. above.

*App to notes (plg) W*

A list of the "Secret/Top Secret" references quoted in the "Dissident Report" (placed on file) by Shri S. Bose, Member, Netaji Inquiry Committee, is placed below. These references are not available in E.A. Section. As the Committee was provided with papers from sources other than the E.A. Sec., the references in question were presumably taken from the papers given by the NGO. Sec. and the Min. of Defence. My my kindly see first and confirm, and also offer their comments with ref. to Min. of Home Affairs' letter at F.R.

Ass  
18/1/57

US (EA)

At-R-1 Lndm  
19/1.

None of the documents (or copies thereof) is available in NGO. One page 199 of his report, Mr. Suresh Chandra Bose has stated that "I consider myself exceedingly fortunate to have succeeded in securing some top secret reports, \*\*\* \*\*\* \*\*\* and in my being able to secure a few photographs, sketches and other papers, which along with other important papers, were indispensably necessary for writing my report and which our Government have intentionally withheld from me, \*\*\* \*\*\* \*\*\*." Prior to this statement, Mr. Suresh Chandra Bose in the penultimate paragraph of the preface of his report has stated that "It was due to some amount of resourcefulness combined with luck, that the secret reports mentioned



mentioned above together with some photographs and sketches could be got hold of." In view of this, it would seem all the more important and desirable to find out the source or the agencies from which Mr. Bose managed to secure copies of the secret and top secret documents in question. Enquiry in this respect may, however, be made in the first instance from General Shah Nawaz Khan, who was the Chairman of the Netaji Enquiry Committee.

8  
19/1/57

29/1  
US(6A)

DS(E) may please see NGO's note from bottom of page 1/N. I suggest that we might refer these papers to the Ministry of Defence for their comments before we send them to General Shah Nawaz Khan, as suggested by the N. G. O. Section.

*M.R. Thadani*  
(M.R. THADANI)  
31. 1. 1957.

DS(E)



-3-

I have glanced through the report. The quotations from the various documents which have been listed at A, which are embodied in the report do not appear to have the same secrecy today as in 1945 and 1946. The final findings of the Committee, presided over by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, the Deputy Minister, have been placed before Parliament, but it would not surprise one if the publication of these extracts does not in any way — more than 10 years after the time — prove damaging to the security of the State. This point, however, will have to be checked with the Ministry of Defence.

2. It will be recalled that we have had one or two other questions arising out of the working of this Committee. We have been trying to retrieve two photographs which Shri Bose took away from the files sent to him as Member of the Committee. We have also had to examine as to whether we should do anything to obtain the copies of papers which Shri Bose kept from the files sent to him in Tokyo. On both, it has been decided that it would be expedient to let the matter rest rather than revive possible embers of controversy. In this connection, FS's decision in the linked file may be seen.

3. Consistent with these decisions, one would be inclined to suggest that in dealing with this publication where Shri S.C. Bose has reproduced documents which obviously were sent to him either under the specific obligation of the official secret act or on the implicit understanding that the secrecy of such official documents will not be abused, have been deliberately published. If the Defence Ministry also agrees that no serious harm can come by the publication of these reports, /...

Linked file

F24(25)-FEA/56

ph 2-3/notes

F24(25)FEA/56

Flag 'P'



it would be desirable not to take any notice and  
advise the Home Ministry to let the matter rest.

( J.S. Mehta )  
5.2.57

JS(E) I agree. ~~Defence~~ F.S.'s decision  
at slip 'P' should be shown to  
Defence Ministry.

B.K. Acharya  
5/2

P.2-3/11/11  
F.24(25) FEA/56

595/8815

JS(E)  
ws(E) MM  
6/2

D.599- EA/57

(3) (R)

(4) Issue

Ministry of Defence New Delhi (Shri P.D. Srivastava)  
EA Ministry u.o. No.D.599- EA/57 dt. 7.2.57

Seen. Thanks. We also agree  
that <sup>matter</sup> may be allowed to rest.  
D.S (A.G.) has seen  
La Srivastava

12/3/57

Min. g S-A

566-S/O(Ahij)  
9/12/3

✓ D.127-11/57

EA  
13/3 with Two Books

3120-S/57

13/3  
H.K. action pl.  
Mr K.C.



Ministry of E.A.

Since the Ministry of Defence have also agreed with this Ministry, there is, perhaps, no need to consult the Dy. Minister. <sup>(Shree Shaktiwaras Khan)</sup> ~~Minister~~. A draft D.O. letter to Shri Raj Kumar of the Home Ministry is put up with reference to D.O. (L); D.O. letter at SMO (4).

$\frac{mV}{18/4/57.}$

US (EA)

At R / Camden

18/4

DS(E) M. HA may see the file with reference  
to my D.O. letter to Sas(4)  
to M. chl

184

3283/520000  
24/4  
u2(ka)

uz(EA)  
R. M. H. A. (Sun Raj Kumar)

Ministry of External Affairs u/o No. F24 (28) FASB 24 23/4/56

Our papers on this subject are linked below.

Some of Mr's photographs and secret reports - which were made available to Mr's NETAJI ENQUIRY COMMITTEE by the Intelligence Bureau were published in the Dissident Report by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, Member of that Committee. In bringing this to our notice, the Intelligence Bureau had raised the question whether any action should be taken in Mr's name against the publisher & author of the Report. We referred this question to the Director of I.A. in G.S. (F)'s <sup>X</sup> d/o letter of Dec 22. 12. 1956. The letter at

X  
S.No (1)



pages 3-4, which deal with this question, may be seen by J.S.(F) and Secretary. Thereafter, this file will be shown to the Intelligence Bureau etc.

The Min. of S.A. have not returned the Dissident Report sent to them with J.S.(F)'s dtd letter to Secy (1)

26.4.57  
Ministry of Home Affairs

\* Please see Secy's letter in the file with at page of the letter of the Secy dated 2/5/57

J.S.(F) when 27/4 (N. S. G. G. H. J. Secy.)  
Secy. A. V. P. (A. V. P. Secy.)

28/4  
28 May 1957  
J.S.(F) Secy

Copy - [Pl. keep copy of this report in file for our file, which is to be deleted]  
Intelligence Bureau (Shri S. N. Hazari)  
M.H.A. no. 3283/57, dtd 1/5/57

Dy No 2213/D  
dt 2-5-57

Intelligence Bureau (MHA)

Seen, thanks. The copy of 'Dissident Report' sent with this office U.O.No.31/DG/56, dated the 20th December, 1956 has not been received back. The same may be returned to this Bureau, for record, when no longer required.

31444

14.5.57  
(N.K. Ray)

Joint Deputy Director.

MHA (Shri Gajinder Singh)  
DIB U.O.No.31/DG/56 dated the

M.H.A. no. 3960/57, dtd 16/5/57

The New. Post may see the J.S. Secy. The Bureau's copy of the 'Dissident Report' was sent to them with our dtd letter at Secy. (1) and may kindly be returned to us for transmission to the I.B. if no longer required by the Secy.

Director of Extension Affairs (Shri M. R. THADANI)

(Gajinder Singh)  
Under Secretary  
Ministry of Home Affairs

M.K.D. 17/5



Ref. Home Ministry's u.d. on pre page.

at slip

The Dissentient Report is placed below. The Ministry of Home Affairs may kindly remove it for onward transmission.

H. K. S. S.  
20.5.57

M. V. Swayathar  
28/5.

R Ministry of Home Affairs. (Shri Gayinder Singh U.S.)

4239/510005  
24/5

M. V. Swayathar 24/28/56 dt 20/5/57

The I.B. may remove their copy of the DISSENTIENT REPORT.

Consent  
21.5.57

Under Secretary  
Ministry of Home Affairs

S  
M. D. A.  
23/5/57

to be sent to  
the Dissentient Report

Intelligence Bureau (Shri N. K. Ray)

M. H. A. No. 4239/510005 dt 24/5/57

Dy No 3274/D  
dt 23-5-57

Intelligence Bureau  
Ministry of Home Affairs.

Removed; thanks.

4548/510005  
28/5

35113

M. H. A. (Shri Gayinder Singh)

D. I. B. U. D. No. 31/56/56, dt.

unlaid  
27/5/57

(N. K. Ray)

Joint Deputy Director.

28 MAY 1957



Returned to Mr. Dir. of Ex. Affairs.  
Expenditure

✓  
D. 2412-FA/57

Dir. of Ex. Affairs (Shri P. K. Madani)

28.5.57

Ministry of Home Affairs

M.H.A. no. 4548/57 (all 5) dt. 29/5/57

Ministry of External Affairs

Record B' Form

20-5-57

MD

29/5  
29/5

M/K  
29/5



*Annex to 1005*  
MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS.  
(EA SECTION)  
---

- (1) Page 188 - Report by the Counter Intelligence Corps.,  
G.H.Q. AFPAC dated 29.9.45.
  
- (2) 190 - Top Secret Report dated 29.9.45 of the Combined  
British and American Intelligence Officers.
  
- 9 ✓ (3) 191 - Secret Headquarters Main File 10 Misc. I.N.A.,  
273 I.N.A.
  
- (4) 193 - To O.C.Kikan, from Chief of Staff Southern  
Army, Staff II Signal 66, 20th Aug. Top Secret -
  
- (5) 194 - Extract from Allied Land Forces S.E.A., No.57  
for week ending 2 November 1945.
  
- ✓ (6) 195 - Extract from Top Secret letter No.SLO/CS/1  
dated 1.3.46 from C. I.C.B., to A.D. (J).
  
- (7) 196 - No.C-5, Intelligence Bureau. (H.D.), New Delhi  
3, Dated the 19 Feb. 46, Secret.
  
- (8) 212 - Allied Secret Report No.10/Misc/I.N.A.



Correspondence





SHRI N. SAHGAL ICS,  
JOINT SECRETARY.  
SECRET

D. 7253-75 D. 299-EA/57

D.O. No. 18483/56-Poll (1)

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA  
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS.  
NEW DELHI-2,

the 22<sup>nd</sup> December 1956.

Dear Shri Dutt,

I enclose a copy of the Director,  
Intelligence Bureau, U.O. No. 31/D.G/56, dated the  
20th December 1956, along with the Dissentient  
Report of Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, for such  
action as you consider necessary. We may kindly  
be informed of your decision in due course.

Not ached.

Dnydhm  
Pstfs

24.12.56

Yours sincerely,

(N. SAHGAL)

J.S.(E) 923155(E) *high OS(E) M. have A' below checked?*  
Shri S. Dutt ICS,  
Foreign Secretary,  
Ministry of E.A.,  
New Delhi.

Bu A  
24/12

26/XII



(2)

SECRET

INTELLIGENCE BUREAU  
(MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS)

---

Will the Ministry of Home Affairs kindly refer to this Bureau's u.o. No. 31/D.G/56, dated 17.8.56 regarding Top Secret documents of the Govt. of India made available to the Chairman of the Netaji Enquiry Committee ?

A { Enclosed herewith is a copy of the book entitled "Dissentient Report" by Suresh Chandra Bose. It would be observed that some of the photographs (Appendix R, Q and S) published in the book are similar to those which were sent by us to the Netaji Enquiry Committee. Similarly, some extracts from secret reports find place in the book vide pages 188-200 of the book. This amounts to unauthorised publication of secret official documents.

It is for consideration of the Ministry of Home Affairs whether any action is to be taken against the author and publisher of the report.

Sd

DEPUTY DIRECTOR

MHA (Shri A.V. PAI)  
DIB U.O. No. 31/D.G/56, dated 20 Dec. 1956.



Secret-

NO. 9231 JS(E)

(3)

*Forwarded*

(2)

24th December 1956.

My dear Sahgal,

*Spd (1)*

This is to acknowledge your  
D.O. No. 10489/56-Poll (1) dated 22nd  
December 1956 addressed to the Foreign  
Secretary, enclosing a copy of the DIB  
U.O. No. 31/D.G/56 dated 20-12-1956 and  
a copy of the "Dissentient Report" of  
Shri Suresh Chandra Bose.

2. I am having the matter examined  
and shall let you know the decision in  
due course.

Yours sincerely,

*B.K. Acharya*

(B.K. Acharya)

Shri N. Sahgal, I.C.S.,  
Joint Secretary,  
Ministry of Home Affairs,  
NEW DELHI.



Shri Raj Kumar, I.A.S. n. 599-5A-57 SECRET.  
Deputy Secretary.

D.o.No.18489/56-Poll(I)



GOVERNMENT OF INDIA  
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS.

New Delhi-2

2nd February, 1957.

Dear Shri Acharya,

Please refer to your d.o. letter  
No.9231 JS(E) dated the 24th December  
1956 to Shri Sahgal, regarding the  
"Dissentient Report" by Shri Suresh  
Chandra Bose. We shall be grateful to  
be informed if you are now in a position  
to let us know the decision taken in the  
matter.

Yours sincerely,

( Raj Kumar )

Shri B.K. Acharya, I.C.S.,  
Joint Secretary,  
Ministry of External Affairs,  
NEW DELHI.

Tel.No. 31256

531/28(E)

File submitted to  
H(E) by 5/2



4  
D.O. No. D. 599 EA/57

6th February 1957.

Dear Shri Raj Kumar,

Kindly refer to your D.O. letter No. 18489/56-Poll(I) of the 2nd February to Shri Acharya regarding the "Dissentient Report" by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose.

The documents reproduced in this report belong to Army Headquarters. We are, therefore, forwarding our file to the Defence Ministry. Thereafter, it may also be expedient to consult Deputy Minister for Transport as to whether any action should be initiated for the unauthorised publication of secret official documents. Prima facie, the Foreign Secretary is of the view that it would be expedient to let this matter rest rather than take the risk of reviving controversy and public interest on the subject of the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. We will, however, write to you again in due course.

Yours sincerely,

( J. S. Mehta )

Shri Raj Kumar,  
Deputy Secretary,  
Ministry of Home Affairs,  
New Delhi.

Issued vide PM. 15/2

an  
7/2

Pl. issue.

an  
7/2



Ministry of External Affairs

R & W Unit

File No. 24(28) FEA/56...

Sl. No.	'Borrower's Name, designation, Sec/Div.	'Dy. No. & date	'To be put up with file No./Dy. No.	Date of issue	'To be returned on or before	'Returned on	'Signature of R.S.
---------	---	-----------------	-------------------------------------	---------------	------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

1-	Shri H.A. Amin S.O (EAD)	5/1092/73 12-9-73	4/551/5/72 J A M 73	12-9-73	16-12-73	14-11-73	Shri H.A. Amin
----	-----------------------------	----------------------	------------------------	---------	----------	----------	----------------

N.B. (1) File should be returned in tact.

(2) It will be the personal responsibility of the borrower to return the file within the specified date.

(3) In case the file can not be returned within the specified date, a fresh requisition slip may be sent with the request to extend the date by another 3 months.



~~5/~~ 640/65 S/1092  
73

62-17-2-11A